Paper Reviewing

Author: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Reviewer Initials\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Criteria | Common Errors  (Tips for judges) | Score |
| Title  & Abstract | 1. Inappropriate or nondescript title 2. Abstract does not summarize Intro/Procedures/Data/Conclusions 3. Title or abstract ineffectively advertises the paper | /10 |
| Introduction | 1. Inadequate explanation of purpose 2. Unclear research objectives by end of introduction 3. Insufficient background literature/information | /10 |
| Methodology  &  Procedures | 1. Loose connection between objectives and procedures 2. Incomplete or disorganized procedures 3. No justification of chosen methods/procedures | /10 |
| Data  &  Results | 1. Loose connection between objectives and results 2. Sloppy/disorganized figures and tables 3. Excessive or unreadable text in figures or captions 4. Key results are not highlighted or discussed | /10 |
| Conclusions  &  Future Work | 1. Summary simply restates paper 2. Condensed results not provided 3. No explanation of where research heads next | /10 |
| Grammar,  Syntax,  & Format | 1. Distracting typographical or grammatical errors 2. Undefined acronyms and abbreviations 3. References not cited 4. Inappropriate changes in tense | /10 |
| Novelty,  Quality,  & Merit | 1. Difficult to discern the novelty of author’s work 2. Quality of work seems below the student’s level 3. Scientific/technical significance of results not clearly stated | /10 |
| Broader Impact | 1. Benefits to society/world not clearly stated 2. Drawbacks or negative aspects not discussed 3. No explanation of why benefits outweigh drawbacks | /10 |
| **Total** | | /80 |

NOTE: The 3 highest and lowest scoring criteria will be reported to students as feedback. Since useful feedback is our goal, please carefully consider perfect scores; an average paper should score 7/10 in each category.

|  |
| --- |
| Additional comments to be reported to speaker (Optional):  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ |