Paper Reviewing

Author: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Reviewer Initials\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Criteria | Common Errors (Tips for judges) | Score |
| Title&Abstract | 1. Inappropriate or nondescript title
2. Abstract does not summarize Intro/Procedures/Data/Conclusions
3. Title or abstract ineffectively advertises the paper
 | /10 |
| Introduction | 1. Inadequate explanation of purpose
2. Unclear research objectives by end of introduction
3. Insufficient background literature/information
 | /10 |
| Methodology&Procedures | 1. Loose connection between objectives and procedures
2. Incomplete or disorganized procedures
3. No justification of chosen methods/procedures
 | /10 |
| Data &Results | 1. Loose connection between objectives and results
2. Sloppy/disorganized figures and tables
3. Excessive or unreadable text in figures or captions
4. Key results are not highlighted or discussed
 | /10 |
| Conclusions&Future Work | 1. Summary simply restates paper
2. Condensed results not provided
3. No explanation of where research heads next
 | /10 |
| Grammar, Syntax,& Format | 1. Distracting typographical or grammatical errors
2. Undefined acronyms and abbreviations
3. References not cited
4. Inappropriate changes in tense
 | /10 |
| Novelty,Quality,& Merit | 1. Difficult to discern the novelty of author’s work
2. Quality of work seems below the student’s level
3. Scientific/technical significance of results not clearly stated
 | /10 |
| Broader Impact | 1. Benefits to society/world not clearly stated
2. Drawbacks or negative aspects not discussed
3. No explanation of why benefits outweigh drawbacks
 | /10 |
| **Total** | /80 |

NOTE: The 3 highest and lowest scoring criteria will be reported to students as feedback. Since useful feedback is our goal, please carefully consider perfect scores; an average paper should score 7/10 in each category.

|  |
| --- |
| Additional comments to be reported to speaker (Optional):\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ |